Companison with rollier countries

Projeon hole US - committee Mandanaa G. P.

cohabiter - For

Triple may Amendment - Aug

British Constitution: Arhicle 9 - Dapan

	British	Indian
Written nature	Unwritten	Written and the lengthiest
Evolution	Product of wisdom and chance from thousand years of development, never framed by any body	Open to evolution and is amended from time time
Flexibility	Passed, amended and repealed by a simple majority	Both flexible as well as rigid
Unitary Vs Federal features	Unitary, British parliament is sovereign, executive organs of the state are subordinate to the parliament	Federal, all powers of the provincial governments are derived from the constitution i.e. costitution is supreme in India
Parliamentary executive	The executive in British has individual legal responsibility	whereas in India there is no legal responsibility.
Sovereignty of Parliament	British parliament is sovereign and can make, amend or repeal any law	Parliament is not sovereign, the basic structure doctrine is applicable with the judiciary having the right to judicial review
Rule of Law	All the three principles of RoL as followed in Britain given by Dicey: 1. Protection form arbitrary arrest and the opportunity to defend oneself	The first two principles are followed in India but the third is not followed. Moreover, in the context of second principle, "The procedure established by
	 Equality before law The Constitution is the result of rights of the individuals protected by the courts in British Constitution whereas in India, the Constitution is the source of the individual rights. 	law" has been replaced by the "Due Process of Law" in the Maneka Gandhi Case 1980
Executive	Executive is known as the crown. The Crown, as an institution, consists of the following:	Executive in India is formed of the following:

	 King, Prime Minister, Council of Ministers (CoM), Permanent Executive, the Civil Servants, Privy Council. 	 President Vice-President Council of Minister with PM as the head
Nature of the Monarchy	Constitutional Monarchy	Democracy
Prime Minister	It is a convention in Britain that the PM will always be a member of the Lower House (House of Commons) only.	The PM can be a member of either House of Parliament, i.e. Lok Sabha or Rajya Sabha.
Rajya Sabha and the House of Lords	Only a delaying chamber	Rajya Sabha has equal power with Lok Sabha as far as the amendment of the Constitution is concerned.

: Minus Asimphotoms 3

American Constitution:

	American	Indian
Length of the constitution	Shortest and the first written constitution	Lengthiest written constt in the world
Flexibility	Rigid and has only 7 Articles and 27 amendments	Mix of rigidity and flexibility with more tint towards the flexible side
		Original constitution:
,		395 Articles
		22 parts
		8 schedules
		Now:
	,	• 470 articles
		• 25 parts

JER

Marbory V3 madison

ICB Casc

		• 12 schedules
Evolution	It was finalized in a convention held on September 17, 1787, which required its ratification by a minimum of nine States, for it to be enforced. Came into operation on 13th September 1788 after ratification by 11 states	It was adopted by her Constituent Assembly on 26th November 1949, and came into effect on 26th January 1950.
Duality	Dual constitution and dual citizenship	One single constitution and one single citizenship
Federation	Dual Federation (USA) — both the Centre and state are completely independent. They are complete governments	Cooperative Federation (India) – Interdependence of Centre and state govt. Neither of them is independent of the other. Centre usually has the role of big brother
	Centrifugal federalism	Centripetel federalism
eningeals	Symmetrical federalism – all states are given equal representation in Senate	Asymmetrical federalism — 1. States have been given representation in Rajya Sabha on the basis of their population. 2. Articles 370, 371 provide special provisions to few states.
	USA is a Legislative federation. This means that States have dominance in law making.	India is an Executive federation. This means that states are important at the executive level only.
	USA is an indestructible union of indestructible states	India is an indestructible union of destructible states
	USA constitution provides a role to states in ratifying the international treaties through the Senate	There is no such provision for states in the Indian Constitution
orm of Government	Presidential form of government	Parliamentary form of government:

200000000000000000000000000000000000000		
	 Direct Election Not accountable to the House of Congress Fixed Term of 4 years Can be appointed for only two terms Reasons for impeachment: Treason, Bribery, High crimes of misdemeanor 	 President - Executive head President runs the government with the aid and advise of the PM and the CoM Term - 5 years Can be elected any number of times Impeachment by the legislature is the only similarity between the two Reasons for impeachment: Violation of constitution
Vice President	Ex Officio chairperson of the Senate and has casting vote	Similar to US, the <u>only difference</u> is that Vice president holds the office of the president only till the new president is appointed
Committee system	Pigeon Holing a bill means when the bill gets killed at the committee stage itself without even the first reading	The bill is referred to the committee only after the first reading
Separation of Powers	All the three branches of the government have separate functions The term of Legislature and Executive are fixed and do not depend on each other. None of the member of the Legislature can be a member of the Executive. The Houses of Congress enact the law; the President executes the law; and the Supreme Court interprets the law.	Theoretical, with SoP applicable only to the Executive and Judiciary President is a part of the Union Executive. Yet, it is the Prime Minster and the Council Ministers who are the real executive The Prime Minster, in his capacity as the leader of the ruling party can enact a law, which his administration executes.
Fundamental Rights	Bill of Rights	Fundamental Rights
Distribution	No elaborative mechanism	Seventh schedule with center, state and concurrent

7th sch X

of legislative powers	Certain Federal issues are specified are under the union government, rest are with the state government	list and residuary powers with the union government
Judicial Appointment s	Judicial Committee, President and the public all are involved and the appointments are made by a very transparent process	Collegium system which Is subject to criticism

Chinese Constitution:

	Chinese	Indian
Preamble	The five principles of Panchsheel have been recognized even in the constitution:	Preamble shows the nature of Indian constitution as inspired by the Nehru's "Objectives Resolution"
and the state of t	 Respect and Preservation of the territorial integrity of all nations Avoidance of aggression Non-interference in the internal affairs of other countries Promotion of international cooperation Peaceful coexistence 	The preamble basically gives idea of the following things/objects: • Source of the Constitution • Nature of Indian State • Statement of its objectives • Date of its adoption
Basic Principles	Socialist State	Socialist + Democratic State
Unitary	Unitary Multi-national state People are declared as fountain of power and authority and they will exercise it through National People's Congress.	Federal Structure with a unitary tint
	Decentralization is there to increase the people's participation	Phoque Hippin I) shinest
<u>Democratic</u> Centralism	Keeping in view democratic norms,	Democratic federalism

	principle has been introduced at all levels not only within the governmental institutions but also within the Party organization. All the citizens have been secured the right to vote on the basis of adult suffrage.	
Party System	One Party System	Multi Party System
Legislature	The National People's Congress (NPC) comprises the legislative branch	Coalition System
4	Unicameral	Bicameral
	Congressmen are elected by regional Congresses, by autonomous regions, by Municipalities working under the central government and by People's Liberation Army, each according to its quota.	Direct Election to the Lok Sabha and the Indirect Election to the Rajya Sabha by the electoral college
	Mode of election is based on secret ballot	Lok Sabha - <u>Secret</u> Ballot Rajya Sabha - Open Ballot
Duration	5 years but can be extended and can be shortened	
	Sessions are held once a year in Beijing	Sessions with not more than 6 months time period between them
	The NPC is the supreme law-making body. The acts of the Congress cannot be challenged in the Supreme Court.	Parliament is supreme law making body but the legislative powers are federally divided based on the 7th schedule
	The Chinese constitution has prescribed certain duties for the citizens which are legally enforceable	Fundamental Duties in Indian constitution are not enforceable

French Constitut	cion:	
	France (Laboratory of Political Experiment)	Indian
Form of government	Unitary and semi-presidential Ideals: Liberty, Equality, Fraternity	Federal and prime

		ministerial
Supreme Law- making body	On some matters, it is parliament and on others it is the president which makes the law	
	Only democratic constitution based on the principle of supremacy of executive	
President	President is most powerful	
	French PM, unlike that in India and Britain, is assistant to the President	
Separation of powers between PM and president	There is a division of functions, rather than division of power between the two positions The French President deals with foreign policy and national concerns	
	The PM, on the other hand, deals with day to day routine functions of the Government and local domestic issues	
Sautomitals Sautomitals	 Concept of Cohabitation' A situation where the President and the PM belong to different political parties 	
	PM may choose his cabinet colleagues	
	Cabinet is presided over by the President, but the ministers shall not be the members of the parliament	
	The Lower House can pass the 'Censure Motion' against the PM and his CoM, which would imply that they must resign	
Term of President	The President is elected for a fixed term of 5 years directly by the people and 2 ballot system (after the 1962 amendment). Not more than 2 consecutive terms	
mpeachment of President	Removal of the president is the same as that of the US but a committee called High Court of Justice is formed to dealt with the case	
Emergency Powers	These powers are with the president	
he Legislature	Parliament can make laws only on the matters enumerated in the Constitution. On all other matters, the government can	

	 make laws by simple order or decree. If the assembly doesn't agree to a particular bill, it can be given for referendum by the President. 	
Amendment	Rigid Process, President initiates any amendment on recommendation of the PM. It shall be passed by both the houses and also approved by a referendum	
The Community	Association between the French Republic and its overseas territories and departments. Members of the community have equal status	
Constitutional Council	It functions as a judicial watchdog and ensures that the executive decrees and parliamentary laws conform to the provisions of the constitution.	

Germany Constitution:

four-year term

Representation (MMPR)

• The method of election is known as Mixed Member Proportional

	Germany	India
Nature	Germany is a federation and the residuary powers in Germany lie with the states.	India is a federation but the residuary powers in India lie with the centre.
PM	Chancellor = PM Germany is called as Chancellor's Democracy	Ded Losu
Constructive Vote of No Confidence	The motion of no-confidence against the Chancellor is permitted only when those bringing the notion can prove that they are in a position to form an alternative government. This is also to deal with the problems of Hung Assembly (Coalition Government)	
Parliament	Bundestag = Lower House Members are elected for a	

o Half of the members are elected directly from 299 constituencies using the FPTP system
o The other half – another 299 - are elected from the list of
the parties on the basis of each Land.
Bundesrat = Upper House
• was and to be and prought the commen

Japanese Constitution:

	Japan	India
Form	Parliamentary	
	 King is more like a 'Rubber stamp' authority while PM is head of the Cabinet 	ada e vignum vida ada a vilesspolles m ressa de vez
Election of PM	PM is elected by both the Houses of Japanese Parliament (called Diet).	minimizer Asiati
	It is not enough for a person to be a leader of the majority party. He has to be elected by both the houses of the Parliament.	a nives nun (2000)
	A significant feature of Japanese Constitution is contained in Article 9. • Herein, Japan formally renounces the policy of war for the settlement of international disputes. However, it can keep forces for self-defence.	Line and the second of the sec

Canadian Constitution:

	Canada	India
Form	Constitutional monarchy (The Constitution Act 1867)	
	Canadian Monarchy (which Canada shares with Great Britain and some other former British colonies). The British Queen is the formal head of the state.	
Features of Parliamentary government	The Act established a federal Parliament, consisting of the Monarchy and two legislative chambers, the House of Commons (or Lower House) and the Senate (or Upper House).	
	Members are elected by the first-past-the-post system (as in Britain) in each of the country's electoral districts, which are colloquially known as (constituencies) in Britain).	
tyr	The maximum term of MPs is four years, but it is common for a general election to be called earlier.	
Federation	Canada is a federation with a strong Centre, wherein residuary powers lie with the Centre. Over the years there has been a shift towards giving greater powers to the states.	Same
Judiciary	The Supreme Court of Canada is the highest court and final authority on civil, criminal and constitutional matters.	
	The court's nine members are appointed by the Governor-General on the advice of the Prime Minister and the Minister of	11 to NOAC

	Justice.	
Rights	Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms	
	is a bill of rights entrenched in the	
	Constitution	
	of Canada	

Australian Constitution:

	Australia	India
System of Government	Follows the liberal democratic tradition	Proceduração The Associates Co
Federation	Australian federation is modeled on the US federation. For example, residuary powers are with the states, Governors of the states	month accounts of a control of
	are elected by the people and formally appointed by the British Queen.	Committee of the Commit
	In Australia, there has been a growth of Cooperative Federalism.	
Form of government	the Commonwealth of Australia was created in 1901, when the former British colonies—now the six states—agreed to federate.	on ared M - a And algres
Separation of powers	SoP is there but the members of the legislature must also be members of the executive.	
Parliament	Consists of two chambers: the House of Representatives and the Senate.	
	Ministers are bound by the principle of Cabinet solidarity, which closely mirrors the British model of Cabinet government responsible to the Parliament.	Content of the Conten
	Although, Australia is an independent nation, Queen Elizabeth II of Great Britain	Letter transport the

	is also formally the Queen of Australia. The Queen appoints a Governor-General (on the advice of the elected Australian Government) to represent her. The Governor-General has wide powers, but by convention acts only on the advice of the ministers on virtually all matters.	
Nature of Constitution	Written	
Procedure of amendment	The Australian Constitution can be amended only with the approval of the electorate through a national referendum in which all adults on the electoral roll must participate. After getting passed by both the houses of the Parliament, the bill has to follow the Triple Majority rule • a national majority of electors as well as • a majority of electors in a majority of the states (at least four of the six). • Where any state or states are particularly affected by the subject of the referendum, a majority of voters in those states must also agree to the change. Generally it is rigid to amend	
Parliament	Senators are elected for six-year terms, and in an ordinary general election only half the senators face the voters.	
Nature of elections	A national general election must be held within three years of the first meeting of a new federal Parliament.	

1 sind red red

	The average life of Parliaments is about two-and-a-half years.	
Voting	For all citizens over the age of 18 it is compulsory to vote in the election of both federal and state governments, and failure to do so may result in fine or prosecution.	
Relations between levels of government State parliaments are subject to the national Constitution as well as their state constitutions. A federal law overrides any state law not consistent with it.		

Switzerland's constitution:

	Switzerland	India
	Spirit of Republicanism	
	Switzerland is known for its direct democracy. It is hailed as a Dynamic Constitution (features like protection of individual, welfare state et al)	
Executive	Executive vested in the Federal Council	Executive vested in the President
Election of president	Federal Council elected by Federal Assembly	President elected by electoral college
Party system	Absent	Party government
International treaties	Cantons can conclude treaties	States cannot conclude treaties
Judiciary	Judiciary cannot rule invalid a federal law	Supremacy of Judiciary
Direct democarcy	Referendum possible	No referendum

Q.4) How is Indian judicial system different from that of the USA? Should India move towards a more federal judicial system? Discuss.

Approach: Start by defining judiciary and its role. List the contrasting features of judicial system in India and USA. In next part, discuss how the SC has emerged as a more powerful authority in India. Mention arguments in favour and against a more federal judicial system for India in a tabular form. Conclude the answer by highlighting certain measures to improve judicial performance rather than changing its very character.

India and USA are both democratic, federal, constitutional republics. The principal role of judiciary in both the countries is to uphold rule of law, interpret the constitution and safeguard the rights of individuals. However, there are certain contrasting features in their judicial systems, as listed below:

Judiciary in India	Judiciary in USA
There is an integrated judiciary (with subordinate courts under the HCs and HCs under SCs). All courts can enforce any law.	The judicial system is segregated. Federal laws an administered by federal courts and state laws an administered by state courts. Supreme Court of the United States (SCOTUS) is the highest court in the federal judiciary. Every state has its own supreme court, as a final appellate authority.
Indian constitution originally followed procedure established by law (Due process of law was adopted after the Maneka Gandhi case) Jury system abolished	US judiciary follows 'due process of law' [Jury system] is also followed.
Relatively narrow Judicial Review (JR), limited to upholding constitutional supremacy.	Wider JR, leading to principle of judicial supremacy.
Original Jurisdiction of SC is confined to federal matters and writ jurisdiction.	SCOTUS enjoys wider original authority such as cases o naval forces, maritime activities, federal disputes etc.
SC can grant Special Leave against orders by any Court/tribunal (except military tribunal/court martial). Appellate jurisdiction includes constitutional, civil and criminal cases.	SCOTUS does not have such absolute powers. Appellate jurisdiction in constitutional cases and cases related to federal laws only.
SC has advisory jurisdiction.	No Advisory role.
Judges of SC are appointed by the President on the recommendation of a collegium system.	President recommends the name of judges to the senate and with the consent of the senate, president appoints the judges of SCOTUS.
Judges hold office till the age of 65 years. Constitution also provides qualification.	Judges are appointed for life. The constitution does not provide qualification.
Both the houses involved in removal of judges.	Only senate takes part in removal.

Due to overriding powers of the SC in an integrated judiciary, some scholars have made case for a more federal judiciary in India. However, such a system has both advantages and disadvantages as discussed below:

Forum Learning Centre: Delhi-2nd Floor, IAPL House, 19 Pusa Road, Karol Rogh, New Delhi-110005 | Patna-2nd floor, AG Palace, E Boring Canal Road, Patna, Bihar 800001 | Hyderabad - Ist & 2nd Floor, SM Plaza, RTC X Rd, Indira Park Road, Jawahar Nagar, Hyderabad, Telangana 500020 | 9821711605 | https://academy.forumias.com | admissions@forumias.academy | helpdesk@forumias.academy

Join @cse_updates on Telegram

Join @cse_updates on Telegram

Federal rudiciary

Page 5 of 13

Advantages 1. HCs are better placed to decide regional and local matters as they have better understanding of regional issues. For example: in 2018, SC set a window of two hours in night for bursting Diwall crackers, however, Diwall is celebrated in day in many states of South India. 2. A federal judiciary will enhance the access to

- A federal judiciary will enhance the access to justice by reducing geographical barriers.
- Reduced burden on SC (due to reduced appeals), enabling it to focus on constitutional matters; reduced pendency.
- Centralized judiciary tend to favour union government.
- 5. Interference of SC in HC dilutes the authority of HC and confidence of people in HC.

Disadvantages

- State courts are more likely to be influenced by regional sentiments and may not act with complete neutrality.
- 2. India has a single constitution with an integrated judiciary adjudicating both the federal and state laws, introduction of Federal judiciary may distort basic structure of the constitution.
- 3. Without sufficient number of judges, and infrastructure, a decentralised judiciary would be just as dysfunctional.
- 4. Fragmentation of judiciary may make them vulnerable to corruption, reducing their authority.















